

Culture and the Europeanization of Citizenship:

normative and policy implications

Uta Staiger
University of Cambridge
us209@cam.ac.uk

*European Citizenship and Cultural Identity Seminar
Centre for Modern European Studies, University of Copenhagen, 20 Jan 2009*

The emergence of culture as an arena of intense political controversy is one of the most puzzling aspects of our current condition. (Seyla Benhabib, *The Claims of Culture*)

OUTLINE

1. The role of culture for the definition and exercise of citizenship
2. The Europeanization of citizenship – implications
3. An analysis of culture and citizenship policy discourse by EU institutions

- 'Effective democracy, nationalism, the reform of the welfare state and immigration all pose challenges to our understanding of individual rights, political and social conflicts, and the nation state; [all these] can be, and have been, addressed through the prism of citizenship discourses' (Shafir 1998: 1-2).
- Term losing analytical precision? Role and nature of its 'normative valence' (Bosniak 2006)?
- Citizenship as a 'site of competing visions of political community' (Delanty 2008: 61)

Terminology

Shafir, G. (ed.). 1998. *The Citizenship Debates: A Reader* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press)

Delanty, G. 2008. 'European Citizenship: A Critical Assessment', in Isin, E.F. et. al.(eds.) *Citizenship between Past and Future* (London: Routledge)

Bosniak, L. (2006). The Citizen and the Alien. Princeton, Princeton University Press

- Liberal theory: juridical membership in a political community
- Legal status comporting set of entitlements
- All individuals represent 'self-originating sources of valid claims' (Rawls 1971)
- Positive and negative freedom
- T.H. Marshall: progressive model of citizenship rights; tension between formal equality and existing social inequality
- Cultural conditions indirectly attended to as derivations of personal freedoms and equality (freedom of expression, the arts, etc.)

Citizenship as Rights

Three aspects of citizenship

Marshall, T. H. 1992 [1949].
Citizenship and Social Class (London: Pluto Press)

Rawls, J., 1971. *A Theory of Justice* Cambridge/Mass: Harvard University Press.

- Citizenship generates 'a shared experience of the state-subject tie' (Tilly 1995: 12).
- 'we make and inhabit meaningful worlds' intersubjectively (Waltzer 1983: 314).
- Individual linked to cultural traditions and identities; communities to be considered in a conception of democratic justice
- Rights claims for minority cultures from both communitarian and revised liberal theory ('multiculturalism'). Problem: culture as paradigm for the political.
- Targets 'injustices it understands as cultural, which it presumes to be rooted in social patterns of representation, interpretation, and communication' (Fraser 2003: 13).
- The result can be a 'decoupling of cultural politics from social politics and the relative eclipse of the latter by the former' (Fraser 1997: 2).

Citizenship as Identity

Three aspects of citizenship

Tilly, C., 1995. Citizenship, Identity and Social History. *International Review of Social History*, 40.

Waltzer, M., 1983. *Spheres of Justice: A Defense of Pluralism and Equality* New York: Basic Books.

Fraser, N., 1997. *Justice Interruptus* London: Routledge.

Fraser, N. & Honneth, A., 2003. *Redistribution or recognition?: A political-philosophical exchange*. London: Verso.

- Mobilization and interaction of citizens as social actors in a public sphere = constitutive of citizenship
- 'complex cultural dialogue (Benhabib 2002), contestation of narratives
- Importance of individual and associational participation: 'In the wake of sub-politicization, there are growing opportunities to have a voice and a share in the arrangement of society for groups hitherto uninvolved [...]: citizens, the public sphere, social movements, expert groups [...]' (Beck et al. 1994: 23)
- Culture may here provide 'arenas for staging just those dialogues and reciprocities that are fundamental to sustaining a pluralist democracy' (Born 2006: 114)

Citizenship as Participation

Three aspects of citizenship

Benhabib, S., 2002. *The Claims of Culture: Equality and Diversity in the Global Era* Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Beck, U., Giddens, A. & Lash, S. (eds.) (1994) *Reflexive modernization: politics, tradition and aesthetics in the modern social order*, Cambridge: Polity Press.

Born, G., 2006. Digitising Democracy. In J. Lloyd & J. Seaton (eds.) *What can be done?: making the media and politics better*. Oxford: Blackwell.

- Axiomatic status of nation state; citizenship as an instrument of closure
- 'National citizenship is that distinctively modern institution through which every state constitutes and perpetually reconstitutes itself as an association of citizens, publicly identifies a set of persons as its members, and residually classifies everyone else in the world as a noncitizen, an alien' (Brubaker 1992: xi).
- Political and economic integration, migration, human rights: challenge to national citizenship.
- Treaty of Maastricht (1992): formal and normative questions re. the status of EU citizenship. Amsterdam (1997): to 'complement, not replace' national citizenship
- it is perhaps less important that the innovations are small than that they are breaches in normal conventions' (Meehan 1997: 73).

Europeanization of Citizenship

Brubaker, R. 1992. *Citizenship and Nationhood in France and Germany* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press)

Meehan, E. 1993. *Citizenship and the European Community* (London: Sage)

- EU citizenship a transformation of national citizenship in terms of rights and allegiance?
- Referendum rejections of Lisbon and constitutional treaties; decline in electoral participation, party affiliation, etc.
- 1999 Eurobarometer on shared European cultural identity: 38% agree, 49/ disagree
- 6 out of 10 attached to the EU
- Eurobarometer 2008 on image of EU: 48% positive, 35% neutral, rest negative.
- New paradigm: Europe needs 'a culture that allows the finding of a transnational order based on the assumption (or fiction) of a consensus. However, such a consensus on a common European culture is the object of a complex dissensus that is constitutive of this transnational society' (Eder 2000: 225).

Europeanization of Citizenship cct.

Eder, K., 2000b. Integration through Culture? The Paradox of the Search for a European Identity. In K. Eder & B. Giesen (eds.) *European Citizenship: between national legacies and postnational projects*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 222-244.

- Culture and citizenship policy domains develop in step with each other
- Early phases: rights-based, economic liberties, 'market citizenship', culture as an economic matter
- From 1970s: Discursive connections.
- Argument: three "semantic clusters"
 - Identity/ontological
 - Intercultural
 - Participatory
- Each: different conception of the two domains and of policy-making in them

Culture and Citizenship in EU Policy

EUROPEAN UNION
Semantic Clusters

Roche, M. (2001).
Citizenship, Popular Culture
and Europe. Culture and
Citizenship. N. Stevenson.
London, Sage Publications:
74-98.

- Culture a sensitive policy area, traditionally of national sovereignty
- 'The creation of EU cultural policy can be seen as part of the EU's "will to power." By isolating and classifying a specific domain of "European culture" and then establishing programmes to intervene and order that sector [...] EU cultural policy not only functions to bolster the legitimacy of the EU project, it also enlarges the scope of EU power and authority, extending its competences into new "occupied fields" of governance' (Shore 2006: 10)
- 'a project of social engineering uncomfortably reminiscent of other failed modernist ideologies of the twentieth century' (2006: 21))

Cultural Policy

EUROPEAN UNION

Shore, C. (2006). "'In uno plures" (?). EU Cultural Policy and the Governance of Europe." Cultural Analysis **5**: 7-26

- Struggles between 'minimalist' (UK, Denmark) & 'maximalist' states (France, Greece)
- Prevalence in discourse since 1970s (before Community competence)
- legal constraints of culture article
 - Subsidiarity
 - Unanimity (not in Lisbon Treaty)
 - No legislative harmonization
- Treaty on European Union (Maastricht 1992), Art. 8 introduces citizenship & 128 (now 151) introduces culture
- Amsterdam Treaty 1997, Art. 17: citizenship to 'complement, not replace national citizenship'
- Culture 0.4% of the budget (stand: 2009); both in the same Directorate General

Cultural and Citizenship Policy

EUROPEAN UNION
History and background

Sandell, T. (1996). Cultural Issues, Debate, and Programmes. Handbook of the European Union. P. Barbour. London, Fitzroy Dearborn: 268-278

Meredyth, D. and J. Minson, Eds. (2001). Citizenship and Cultural Policy. London, Sage

- Paris Summit 1972: economic integration not enough
- Copenhagen Declaration 1973: 'the European identity'
- Tindemanns Report 1975
 - "A Citizen's Europe"
 - area of culture "essential"
- Adonnino Report 1985
 - "A People's Europe"
 - "social and human dimension"
- 1987 'Fresh Boost' Communication: role of culture for popular support → legitimacy
- Culture 2000: citizens' common cultural roots and values are a 'key element of their identity and their membership'
- Congruence of cultural and political identities?

Semantic Clusters

ONTOLOGICAL PARADIGM

Tindemans, L. (1975). Report on European Union, Bulletin of the European Communities. **1976:** 11-35.

Adonnino, P. (1985). "A People's Europe. Reports from the ad hoc committee." Bulletin of the European Communities **1985**(7)

- Diversity discourse: 'our common cultural heritage [...] expresses itself in the diversity of our local, regional and national cultures' (CEC 1987)
- Shift to 'Intercultural dialogue'
- Europeanization of immigration policies (ASJF 1997, Tampere 1999, Hague Programme 2004)
- Alienage status 'citizenship of non-citizens' (Bosniak 2006) → Europe for Citizens 2004 also addresses non-citizen residents
- 'Transcultural diversity' (Robins 2007)
- 2007 Communication on a European agenda for culture in a globalizing world makes intercultural dialogue a key objective, Culture 2007
- Year of Intercultural Dialogue 2008: 'a horizontal and trans-sectoral priority' & addresses 'any individual living permanently or temporarily in the EU'

Semantic Clusters

INTERCULTURAL PARADIGM

Robins, K. (2007).
 "Transnational Cultural Policy and European Cosmopolitanism." Cultural Politics **3**(2): 147-174.

- Citizenship as engagement, participation, public reasoning?
- Active citizens & civil society as way of enhancing 'input legitimacy'
- 'republican notions of participation remain the Achilles heel of EU citizenship' (Bellamy et.al. 2006)
- Since Nice Treaty 2000: structured dialogue with civil society, active citizens
- 2004 Europe for Citizens Programme: interaction and participation a means to develop EU citizenship; 'a sense of ownership'
- Culture2007: participation in culture as 'encouraging direct participation by European citizens in the integration process'
- Cultural sector as interlocutor (structured dialogue with EU institutions through 3 platforms)

Semantic Clusters

PARTICIPATORY PARADIGM

Bellamy, R., D. Castiglione, et al. (2006). Making European Citizens. Civic Inclusion in a Transnational Context. Basingstoke, Palgrave Macmillan.

New agendas?

Divided answer:

Both no – resilience of identity paradigm

And yes – introduction of intercultural and particularly participatory paradigms

Increasing legitimacy of 'culture' as important for citizenship

Culture and the Europeanization of Citizenship

CONCLUSIONS